

5j **3/11/2057/FP - Detached open cart lodge at Elm Side, Horseshoe Lane, Great Hormead, SG9 0NQ for Mr White**

Date of Receipt: 28.11.2011

Type: Full – Other

Parish: HORMEAD

Ward: BRAUGHING

RECOMMENDATION:

That planning permission be **GRANTED** subject to the following conditions:

1. Three Year Time Limit (1T121)
2. Approved Plans (2E10) (Insert: SE1; D111002 B)
3. Materials of Construction (2E11)
4. Tree retention and protection (4P05)
5. Hedge retention and protection (4P06)

Summary of Reasons for Decision

The proposal has been considered with regard to the policies of the Development Plan (East of England Plan May 2008, Hertfordshire County Structure Plan, Minerals Local Plan, Waste Local Plan and the saved policies of the East Herts Local Plan Second Review April 2007), and in particular policies GBC3, ENV1, ENV5 and ENV6. The balance of the considerations having regard to those policies, the amendments made to the proposal following the refused application ref: 3/10/0985/FP and the limited impact of the building on the openness and character of the Rural Area is that permission should be granted.

_____ (205711FP.SE)

1.0 Background:

- 1.1 The application site is shown on the attached OS extract.
- 1.2 The dwelling is located on the southern edge of the village of Great Hormead, which is designated within the East Herts Local Plan Second Review April 2007 as being within the Rural Area Beyond the Green Belt.
- 1.3 The proposal is to erect an open car port in the North Western corner of

3/11/2057/FP

the site. It is proposed to measure 5.7 metres in width, 6 metres in depth, 2.4 metres in height to the eaves, and approximately 4.6 metres in height to the ridge of the roof. The roof is proposed to be of a half-hip design, and two small roof lights are proposed in the south facing roof slope. The car port is to be sited forward of the dwelling and is screened from the highway by an existing mature 3 metre high Cypress hedgerow that is proposed to be retained.

2.0 Site History:

2.1 Application reference 3/10/0984/FP proposed the development of a detached garage and store measuring 6 metres in width, 9.3 metres in length and 5.6 metres in height to the ridge. This was refused for the following reason:

1. *The proposed detached garage and store, by reason of its size, scale and siting, would be unduly prominent and incongruous within the surrounding street scene to the detrimental of the character and appearance of the locality. The proposal is thereby contrary to the saved policies ENV1 and ENV5 of the East Herts Local Plan Second Review April 2007.*

2.2 In refusing this application the Delegated Officer considered that whilst there is no objection in principle to limited extensions and outbuildings to dwellings within the Rural Area, it was considered that the steep pitched roof and 9.5 metres long unbroken side elevation, which would be in close proximity to the highway, would have been a prominent feature within the surrounding rural locality.

2.3 Application reference 3/10/0985/FP gained planning permission for the raising of the roof of the dwellinghouse together with the insertion of 4 dormers to create first floor accommodation, a new front bay window and the conversion of the garage to a habitable room.

3.0 Consultation Responses:

3.1 No consultation responses have been received.

4.0 Parish Council Representations:

4.1 Hormead Parish Council has no objection to this proposal.

5.0 Other Representations:

5.1 The application has been advertised by way of site notice and neighbour

notification.

5.2 No letters of representation have been received.

6.0 Policy:

6.1 The relevant 'saved' Local Plan policies in this application include the following:

- GBC3 Appropriate Development in the Rural Area Beyond the Green Belt
- ENV1 Design and Environmental Quality
- ENV5 Extensions to Dwellings
- ENV6 Extensions to Dwellings – Criteria

7.0 Considerations:

Principle of development

- 7.1 The application site is located within the Rural Area beyond the Green Belt, wherein limited extensions and alterations to dwellings will be permitted in accordance with policies GBC3 and ENV5 of the Local Plan. Policy ENV5 states that the erection of outbuildings will be expected to be of a scale and size that would either by itself, or cumulatively with other extensions, not disproportionately alter the size of the original dwelling nor intrude into the openness or rural qualities of the surrounding area.
- 7.2 As outlined earlier in this report planning permission has been granted for extensions to the dwelling in 2010. The raising of the roof and other related works have subsequently been constructed resulting in an increase in the floor space of the dwelling by some 60% in comparison to the original dwelling. The cumulative increase in size of the dwelling including the proposed cart lodge is calculated to be approximately 93%. Such a cumulative increase does not, in Officer's opinion, represent a limited extension to the original dwelling. In this respect the proposed development does not accord with policies GBC3 or ENV5 of the Local Plan. It is therefore necessary to consider whether other material considerations exist in this case to warrant a departure from policy.
- 7.3 The proposed open cart lodge is modest in terms of its proportions and height and is considered to relate well to the proportions and character of the existing dwelling. The proposed cart lodge is, in this way, considered to be of an appropriate size, scale, form and design that does not result in significant harm to the character or appearance of the dwelling.

3/11/2057/FP

- 7.4 Although the garage will be sited forward of the main dwelling, its limited proportions will be screened from the highway by the existing mature landscaping. The proposed garage will not therefore be significantly visible from the surrounding area and will not result in significant harm to the character and appearance of the surroundings or rural area.
- 7.5 It is therefore Officer's view that the size, scale, siting and design of the proposed cart lodge would not intrude into the openness or rural qualities of the surrounding area, and it is therefore considered that, as outlined above, there are reasons in this case to allow a departure from policy.
- 7.6 It is noted that planning reference 3/11/0984/FP for a detached garage and store was refused in 2011 due to its size, scale and siting, being unduly prominent and incongruous within the surrounding street scene to the detriment of the character and appearance of the locality. Officers consider, however, that whilst this revised application remains in the same location as the garage that was previously refused, the reduction in its size and scale reduces the prominence of the building within the locality to an appropriate level.

Neighbour amenity considerations

- 7.7 Having regard to the relationship of the dwelling to neighbouring properties, there will not be a significant impact on neighbour amenity that would warrant the refusal of the application.

Conditions

- 7.8 Since the proposed plans do not indicate materials of construction, Officers consider it appropriate to include a condition that requires the materials of construction to be agreed in writing prior to the commencement of development.

8.0 Conclusion:

- 8.1 Officers consider that the amount of development proposed cannot be considered as 'limited', and is therefore contrary to policies GBC3 and ENV5 of the Local Plan. However, in this case the proposed cart lodge is considered to be of an appropriate size, scale, siting and design and would not intrude into the openness or rural qualities of the surrounding area or result in harm to the character and appearance of the area.
- 8.2 It is therefore considered that, whilst the proposal does not accord with policies GBC3 and ENV5 of the Local Plan, there are appropriate reasons in this case to allow a departure from policy. In all other

3/11/2057/FP

respects the proposal is considered to accord with the relevant policies of the Local Plan. It is therefore recommended that permission be granted subject to the conditions set out above.